

International Journal of English Language & Translation Studies

ISSN: 2308-5460



Examining the Translation and Scanlation of the Manga *Naruto* into Turkish from a Translator's Perspective

[PP: 161-173]

Ayşe Şirin Okyayuz

Department of Translation and Interpreting, Bilkent University
Ankara, Turkey

ABSTRACT

The collective power of Japanese popular culture permeating the rest of the world through manga and anime is a recent issue of interest for scholars. Studying the scanlation and translation of the manga, which are multimodal texts that hybridize linguistic and visual arts, also entails several topics of discussion and interest for the translation scholar. There are facets of these multimodal texts as in manga the narrative is conveyed through composite, cinematographic narrative with integrated frames. In turn these can yield interesting translation solutions and strategies, especially when compared in terms of the two mediums of production (i.e., in print and on the Internet). The following study entails a comparative analysis of the scanlation and translation of the manga *Naruto* into Turkish especially concentrating on: the format (i.e., arrangement of pages, lettering, typography), what was translated what was not (i.e., dialogues, onomatopoeia, honorifics, names), and the use of diverse translation strategies (i.e., adding notes, dealing with discourses, registers and translators choices). In this sense, as is the aim behind the study, manga translations present translation studies with rich grounds of research into multimodal, multicultural dialogue and interaction. As the potential for intercultural dialogue through comics has never been stronger than the present, manga seem to be a medium through which this may be achieved across cultures. Comparative studies in different languages and cultures would not only be a benefit for the comics' translators and scholars, but also the field of translation, as discussing the abundance of decisions and possibilities would enrich the discipline.

Keywords: *Manga, Translation, Scanlation, Comics, Foreignization*

ARTICLE INFO	The paper received on 05/08/2017	Reviewed on 05/09/2017	Accepted after revisions on 16/10/2017
-----------------	--	----------------------------------	--

Suggested citation:

Okyayuz, A. Ş. (2017). Examining the Translation and Scanlation of the Manga *Naruto* into Turkish from a Translator's Perspective. *International Journal of English Language & Translation Studies*. 5(3). 161-173.

1. Introduction

In translation studies, O'Hagan (2007) draws attention to the collective power of Japanese popular culture permeating the rest of the world through manga and anime, and translation and scanlation. Manga, literally meaning 'irresponsible picture', is the Japanese word for the medium of the comic strip, and in English has come to refer both to Japanese and Japanese influenced comics. Manga are designed for specific audiences and although they share many features with comics, they are later examples. Zanettin (2008, p. 1) states that, comics were born in the USA at the end of the nineteenth century. For some time translated American comics constituted the lion's share of comics published in Europe, South America and Asia and spurred the growth of the genre so that American conventions gave a primary contribution to forging national comics' traditions. According to Ng (2000, p. 44), today Japanese comics play a similar

role as a source of inspiration, and Pilcher and Books (2005, p. 12) state that in terms of Japan, comics are so integral to its culture and society that it would impossible to imagine the country without them.

According to Bryce et al (2008), manga is a 'multimodal text' which hybridizes linguistic and visual arts. Bryce et al (2010) explain that these hybrid texts evolved from the encounter of Japanese art and Western comic art. In the late nineteenth century magazines published in Japan by Westerners exposed Japanese artists to new techniques, and along with the influence of North America, the Japanese artists assimilated and developed their style and produced their own comics.

The study of manga has been undertaken from many different perspectives, for example, studies on representation of characters, themes, visual codes etc. in manga texts. (e.g., Berndt, 2001, 2004, 2007; Couch, 2000; Hahn Aquila, 2007; Hand, 2004; Krebs, 2006;



Nakar, 2003; Natsume, 2006; Pandey, 2000; Rommens, 2000; Toku, 2001; Tsuji, 2001; de la Iglesia 2016; Jude, 2017). Others have discussed genres of manga (e.g., Ito, 2002a, 2002b; Pandey, 2008), the collected works of specific authors and artists (e.g., MacWilliams, 2000, 2002; Onoda, 2003; Pandey, 2001; Phillipps, 2008; Shamoon, 2003; Huang & Archer 2014), the history of manga (Ito, 2005), manga as a cultural product (e.g., McLelland, Mark (Ed.), 2017; Freedman & Slade (Eds.), 2017; Bonser 2017); manga travelling to other medium (e.g., Davis, 2016; Tak-hung, 2017); manga and its influences on history, education, economics and other fields (e.g., Otmazgin & Suter, 2016; Armour & Iida, 2016; Eiji, 2017); the use of translation notes in manga scanlation (e.g., Fabretti, 2016).

There are many reasons why experts from various fields study manga, one of them being the distinct style of this popular culture product. According to Rommens (2000), the manga has a distinct style of visual and textual storytelling, and this is the thorough integration of linguistic elements, flexible frames and speech bubbles, and iconographic images which allow the reader to grasp different levels of meaning simultaneously. Thus, in manga the narrative is conveyed through composite, cinematographic narrative with integrated frames. In this vein, Zanettin (2008, p. 18-19) refers to Japanese manga conventions distancing themselves from Western comics such as: the increase in the use of panels, changes to transitions between panels, the highlighting of mood and sense of place with moment-to-moment panels, character faces with large eyes and small noses and flat faces, bubble tails used to represent whispers, a speechless moment represented with ellipses over the head, movement represented with speed lines and background blurs etc. and furthermore manga having a repertoire of unique visual metaphors.

Jüngst (2007) refers to the wide influence of manga as a vehicle for intercultural influence so great that it led to the composition of manga by German artists which are an amalgam of elements of European and Japanese manga. Furthermore, around the world manga are celebrated with fan clubs, translations, scanlations and web sites devoted to the

phenomenon. On the other hand, Kaindl (1999) states that notwithstanding their importance as a segment of high-volume translation, comics have largely been neglected in translation studies.

In an effort to present an example from one corner of the world where manga has been widely read, the following study compares the two versions of the Japanese manga *Naruto*, the official translation of manga in comic book format¹ and the scanlation² in Turkish from a variety of perspectives. A similar study was conducted in English by Cheng-Wen Huang and Arlene Archer (2014) for *Naruto* by Masashi Kishimoto, and the addition of other studies in other languages can also provide a wider understanding of the country and language specific and well as global realities surrounding manga translations and scanlations.

[2. Manga Translation and Scanlation in Turkey](#)

Manga have also captured the imaginations of Turkish youth. According to Parlak (2015) the first mangas that were read were in English, as the English translations came before the Turkish, and shortly after there were scanlation sites for translations from English into Turkish, followed by others for scanlation from Japanese into Turkish. The first manga, *Gon*, was published in September 1999. Manga are sold in Turkey in book format not as magazines, and generally the Turkish industry prefers mangas that appeal to 15-20 age group.

Today publishers such as *Arunus*, *Tudem*, *Everest*, *Ithaki*, *Gerekli Şeyler*, *Marmara Çizgi* and *Akılçelen* publish manga in Turkey (Parlak, 2015). In the USA, Brienza (2010) refers to the comic industry and the book industry remaining separate, but in Turkey major publishing houses which also have bookstores publish Turkish translated versions of manga.

Rota (2008, p. 93) states that in the 1990's Europe began to import Japanese manga from the USA due to it being easier since the texts were flipped. In Turkey manga were licensed with Turkish translation rights arranged by SHUESHA Inc. through VIZ Media Europe in the case studied.

Anderson Terpstra (2012, p. 39) argues that, given the proliferation of interactive media facilitated by the Internet,

¹ Masaşi Kışimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara Haksöyliylen and Mine Erkmen. İstanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.

² Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri. <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01>

media companies have the ability to listen more carefully to audiences demands. This underlines one of the chief reasons why manga was translated into Turkish-- there was a demand from Turkish youth who had already watched anime and set up their scanlation sites and fan forums (Parlak, 2015).

In Turkey manga and anime fandom are not limited to fansubs and scanlations, they are active in other ways, such as news and information sites, fan sites, forums, manga style games, chat rooms etc. (i.e., *Manga TR Online*, *Manga oku*, *Manga vadisi*, *Manga Türkiye*, *Manga Denizi*, *anime Manga TR*, *Mangalar burada*, *Anime Manga Türkiye Blog*, *animefanfastica*, *Animetr-septynor* etc.).

Although translated manga are said to be relatively expensive in other countries - for example 3-4 times the original price in Australia- in Turkey these are relatively cheap, 10 TL which is 3 Euros. One prominent example from *Viz* publications, which according to Anderson Terpstra (2012, p. 52) continues to outstrip other manga publishers in terms of units sold worldwide, is a famous manga *Naruto* by Masashi Kishimoto, which is to be studied within the context of this article.

Brienza (2010) argues that manga are collective efforts, and though *Naruto* for example is attributed solely to Masashi Kishimoto, the artists name on the manga cover is most appropriately understood as an author function.

In reference to the types of manga of which *Naruto* is an example, the action packed *shonen manga* is a manga for boys. The superhero genre, of which *Naruto* is an example, still remains the mainstream production of comics, but the Japanese manga have an extremely developed system of genres that addresses various combinations or gender and age.

As mentioned above, scanlations for manga are also present in Turkish. Scanlations are the scanning, translation and editing of Japanese manga from one language into another. Scanlations are basically websites of sets of image downloaded via the internet. Despite their dubious legal status, scanlation groups started to become widespread in the 1990's. According to Zanettin (2008, p. 9), translation studies takes an interest in scanlation as these usually effectively pilot commercial publications and are quite difficult endeavours. For example, in reference to translating manga, Sell (2011)

refers to the importance of scanlations and that fans are the main consumers.

Another scholar who has worked on manga, Prough (2010) lists the following as important characteristics of manga texts: displaying informality in the use of casual forms and contractions; incomplete sentences, pauses and hesitations; typographic signs such as exclamation marks, katakana (used for foreign loan words), large font and bold letters, no period, hirigana (symbols for reading Chinese characters) is placed on the kanji in any manga texts; and other characteristics such as onomatopoeia, full sentences going over to the next page, cultural norms and lexemes.

Within the light of the information presented above, the scanlation and translation of the manga *Naruto* into Turkish yields several topics of discussion and interest for the translation scholar. There are several facets of the multimodal text that can yield interesting translation solutions and strategies especially when compared in terms of the two mediums of transmission (i.e., the printed and the Internet). Initially there is the format which is different from anything else published in Turkey, secondly what gets translated and what does not and the strategies used for translation differ from those of other Disney or European comics in Turkey, a third point of interest in the inherent presence of the Japanese culture handled through different explanation techniques which are again uncommon in comics translated into Turkish, the strategies used for translation of picture like onomatopoeia and the use of writing styles and fonts to deliver messages is another point of interest, and finally of course there is the discourse of the characters and narrator.

3. Comparative Analysis of Translation and Scanlation

The following sections entails a comparative analysis of the scanlation and translation of *Naruto* into Turkish from several aspects: the format (i.e., arrangement of pages, lettering, typography), what was translated what was not (i.e., dialogues, onomatopoeia, honorifics, names), and the use of diverse translation strategies (i.e., adding notes, dealing with discourses, registers and translators choices).

3.1 Format: Arrangement of pages

According to Zanettin (2008, p. 8) manga are usually first published in monthly anthologies and then in smaller pocket sized books called *tankoban* of

approximately 200 pages, and read from left to right and top to bottom. *Tankoban* is described by Rota (2008, p. 82-83) as 12X18 or 12X18cm, soft cover, square bound, black and white books.

The printed versions of *Naruto* in Turkish are typical *tankoban* size, the pages are inverted, the reading direction is from right to left and top to bottom and thus, the original format is retained.

In the scanlations, as the site studied allows for the turning of the page through clicking, the effect of inverted pages is lost, but the reading direction is retained as the original. (Figure 1- Web site for Mangatürk)

Figure 1: Web site bar for clicking to pages in Mangatürk³



Rota (2008, p. 94) cites research by Barbieri which states that the reading habits of Westerners are different from the Japanese and there is room for misunderstanding unless the pages are inverted, but also states that the manga reading public is firmly convinced that a non-inverted manga is the best way to appreciate it. Until 2002, Brienza (2009) has noted that, US manga publishers would mirror image the pages so they would read in a Western fashion, but this labour and cost intensive practice was later abandoned. In the case of Turkey there were never any manga that were inverted in the published versions and in scanlation the original format is also retained.

3.2 Format: Arranging lettering in vertically oblong speech balloons

Another format feature is the unique shape of the speech balloons. Furuhata-Turner (2013, p. 76) explains that the speech balloons in manga are vertically oblong, and the speech must be written from top to bottom. Thus, Turkish words don't fit easily in this type of balloon and Turkish readers of manga have to read Turkish words from top to bottom in the dialogue balloon and the balloons right to left on the page, which is unnatural for them. Jüngst (2008, p. 73) argues that the different visual aspects of the Japanese and Roman alphabets and the fact that the Roman texts will always run counter to the direction,

makes the idea of feigning authenticity very hard.

One example for this is a single word hyphenated several times to fit into the speech balloon from the scanlated version. The main characters name in Roman lettering does not fit into a major part of the balloons in both the versions studied. (see Figure 2)

Figure 2: use of hyphenating for lack of space in balloons⁴



In both the translation and scanlation the speech balloons and the difficulty of fitting Turkish words into the balloons are identical, but the way in which speech is arranged in the balloons differs in the translated and scanlated versions.

The translated versions use the advantage of having a team at their disposal and can change the direction of writing and use top down lettering. (see Figure 3)

Figure 3: Oblong use of speech balloons in translation⁵



On the other hand, the scanlator presumably has less technical knowledge and professionals at his disposal, and would pick the easier or the doable and write in the left to right format. (see Figure 4)

³ <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/04/13>

⁴ Scanlated version taken from: <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/04/13>

⁵ Translated version: Masaşi Kişimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara Haksöyliyen and Mine Erkmen. Istanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.

Figure 4: use of speech balloons in scanlated version⁶



On the other hand, in some instances in the scanlations, though less than the translations, the scanlators have used top to down lettering, especially when the space permits it. (see Figure 5)

Figure 5: Top down lettering in scanlations⁷



According to Zanettin (2008, 13) also because of the possibility of presenting “the non-verbal components of interaction (body language, facial expressions, use of space etc.) dialogues in comics have a quality more akin to drama than to novels.” In this vein there are some instances where the translator opts to change the fonts and directions in the understanding that other parts of the visual will give the effect. Thus, there are also instances in the translations where the translator opts for the deletion of an oblong balloon with the help of his graphics expert. (see Figure 6)

Figure 6: (For full reference compare with Figure 5) Deletion of oblong balloon in translation⁸



In short, though the translators have the advantage of graphics experts (in the case of the Turkish *Naruto* studied graphics experts are Mustafa Kara and Cem Murat Yılmaz) and the original images to work from, this does not always mean that they will retain the format of the original. Due to the composite cinematographic narrative (as shown in Figure 6), or the use of longer forms for better transfer of information (see Figure 6), they may make changes. On the other hand, scanlators with less technical advantages at their disposal, tend to want to create a replica of the original format (see Figure 5), except in instances where it becomes technically difficult to do so (see Figure 2) for example in the inversion of pages.

3.3 Format: Typography

Kaindl (1999, p. 270) in presenting a translation relevant anatomy of comics refers to typographical signs, font type and size, layout and format. Thus, Kaindl (2004, p. 173) has proposed that translation of comics be approached as a multimodality perspective, which would also include the study of typography.

Typography and the type of font used in comics contain information in the conveying of meaning. These, along with iconographic images, allow for the grasping of different levels of meaning simultaneously. According to Young (2008, p. 6), comics rely on a limited number of words to convey a rich feeling. Zanettin (2008, p. 13) refers to words not only having a verbal meaning, but also being embodied in the visual; thus, in the case of manga the font is also very effective.

In the translated and scanlated versions different Comic Craft fonts have been used, which is understandable since this is a comic. In the translations the font is standard comics writing font very similar to Comic Craft Scott McCloud Semi Bold, whereas in the scanlated versions the writing font is very similar to Comic Craft Wild Words regular.

The Scott Mc Cloud Semi Bold font looks more regular to standard Turkish comic book readers, whereas the scanlation font, though similar, presents a difference for Turkish comic book readers. In this sense the scanlated version is slightly more exotic in its choice of font.

3.4 Untranslated vs. Translated

⁶ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri.
http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01

⁷ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri.
http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01

⁸ Translated version: Masaşi Kişimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara Haksöyliyen and Mine Erkmen. Istanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.

In the scanlated and translated versions there are some similarities in what gets translated what does not, but there are also differences due to the constraints of each.

Visually both versions are copies of one another. Even though there are panels without dialogue or writing, all have been 'translated'. On this subject Zanettin (2008, p. 17) claims that the reading pace in Japanese comics is faster due to long sequences in pages without verbal content. Since this is a prominent feature of manga, it is not surprising that both have retained this feature with no deletion.

On the other hand, Celotti (2008) argues that there are misconceptions about comics translation, such as, only the speech inside balloons and boxes are translated and images have a universal meaning, both of which are misconceived. On the other hand, Susanne Phillipps (1996, p. 196 - quoted in Jüngst 2008, p. 72) lists certain pictorial symbols in manga that would not be familiar to non-native readers, but manga readers and get the information from books, magazines or the Internet. Thus, it is not surprising that in both translations and scanlations sometimes leave parts untranslated.

Rota (2008, p. 84) refers to texts in comics being visual elements of the page and pictures themselves needing translations. Rota (2008, p. 84) states that options are adaptation to the local format or a third format, retention of the original and adds that in countries where there is an awareness of the artistic importance of comics and where consequently drastic alterations of original works a domesticating strategy would not be viewed in a favourable light, prefer foreignizing approaches. This is the case in the translated and scanlated Turkish versions.

There are examples of these in *Naruto* in both the scanlated and the translated versions. (see Figures 7, 8)

*Figure 7: Untranslated dialogue in picture in scanlated version*⁹



*Figure 8: Translated dialogue of same panel as scanlated Figure 8 in translated version*¹⁰



Celotti (2008, p. 42) argues that faced with a range of strategies the translator chooses on the basis of the aim either to adapt the comic to the target culture or allow its origin to show through. There are two factors that effect this decision, which are technological capabilities and spatial concerns: Would the scanlator be able to erase the originals? Furthermore, in dealing with spatial limitations, if the scanlator would not be able to erase the original to replace with the translations, there would be no space to add the translations. In this aspect, in a comparison of the scanlated and translated versions, it is clear the scanlator is at a technical disadvantage, if the decision to leave the katakana was not deliberate.

3.5 Translated vs. Untranslated: Onomatopoeia and sounds

Another feature that stands out as being different in the two versions is the translation strategies, or rather the transfer strategies, since in one case there is usually no translation, in terms of onomatopoeia. Kaindl (1999, p. 275) refers to repetition, deletion, detraction, addition, transmutation and substitution as translation strategies in comics. Deletion or addition are the most

⁹ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri. <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01>

¹⁰ Translated version: Masaşi Kışimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara

Haksöyliylen and Mine Erkmen. Istanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.

widely used strategies in the both the Turkish versions.

In reference to onomatopoeia, Jüngst (2008, pp. 64-65) states that these may be left in their original from as in many cases the reader will be able to form an impression of the sound. Before going on, a definition of the Japanese writing system would be useful. Jüngst (2008, p. 61) provides a short explanation of the Japanese writing system:

“Japanese use four different types of writing. First there are two Japanese syllable alphabets, hiragana and katakana. Hiragana is used for mainly structures such as verb endings...Katakana...is used for loan words, certain kinds of onomatopoeia and sometimes for a kind of effect that resembles the use of italics in Roman script. Secondly there are kanji, Chinese characters... Sometimes roman script is used as well for decorative purposes.”

Japanese onomatopoeia is in katakana. In some cases in the translation, and in all cases in the scanlation, these have been left untranslated.

One reason for this may be as Jüngst (2008, p. 60) states that readers expect the translations of manga to give them something close to the original. Levi (2006, p. 43) also argues that though on the one hand mangas are different because of their elements, they are also familiar in that they reflect the experiences and emotions that any reader can identify with. Both may be effectual in the reasoning of the scanlators and translators, in retaining the originals. There may be other concerns too such as the scanlators inability to draw in the missing parts once they delete the katakana and of course the cheaper alternative of not having to change the drawings which is surely a concern for the publishing houses. Some examples of this are. (see Figures 9, 10, 11)

Figure 9: Use of explanatory footnotes 'erotic sounds' in the scanlated version¹¹



¹¹ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri. <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01>

¹² Translated version: Masaşi Kişimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara

Figure 10: Translations¹² of sounds next to originals



Whereas in most cases in the translations there are translations of sounds and especially onomatopoeia, in the scanlations, when these are part of the drawings, this becomes a problem and the scanlators leave it to the readers to infer the sound from the visual which is actually quite easy as the amalgam of visual elements and the surrounding dialogues are clear to the manga reader.

Figure 11: Untranslated scanlation¹³



In the example given in Figure 11 fainting is a sign of great distress in manga and a manga reader would understand the message in the panel given even though the words are not translated. This is supported by Kaindl (1999, 264) who states that comics are narrative form involving signs and components which serve several functions and the form and the use of these are subject to culture specific conventions. These conventions are known by manga readers.

Madeley (2015) talks about extensive online debates among fans. The factors that scanlators for example list as desirable are: original artwork without altered sound effects, cultural end notes, original terms used in texts. The extra textual elements that are introduced into the published work are used to educate the reader in order to create a better understanding of the original. The elements,

Haksöyliyen and Mine Erkmen. Istanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.

¹³ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri. <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01>

in short, should underscore that the translation is a translation. This is echoed in Jüngst (2010, p. 83) who states that 20 years ago manga were Europeanized in translation, but today feigned authenticity is the expectation of the readers.

Hall (1977) states that cultural forms of communication choices can be explained in forms of high context cultures and low context cultures; narrative structure of manga reflects the cultural form of communication inherent to Japan which is high context culture, and people in the groups have mutual understanding, there is less verbal and more non-verbal communication. According to Ito (2005, p. 456) this method of communication is very efficient within a group, but less efficient outside of that group. In this sense manga readers and fans are groups of their own, in that, they are familiar with the culture of Japan to the degree that inferring the sounds and the noises etc. would not be difficult for them, though it may be for an outsider.

3.6 Translated vs. untranslated: Honorifics and Names

In the translation of honorifics, a prominent feature of the Japanese culture, thus an important feature of understanding character relations and status in manga, the scanlators and the translators seem to be on the same page in Turkey-- this feature is retained. For example, this is not the case in the American versions of manga. (see picture 12)

Figure 12: Honorifics translation in Turkish (left) and American (right) versions of *Naruto*¹⁴



As can be seen in Figure 12 the Turkish versions retain the use of *sensei* and the honorific *-kun* whereas in the American version this is replaced with 'master' in one case and deleted in the other.

Jüngst (2008, p. 68) explains that Japanese honorifics *-san* and *-kun* are for boys and young men, *-sensei* for a teacher. This feature is explained in the initial section of the Turkish printed version with detailed analysis of status positioning in the use of *-sama*, *-san*, *-chan* and *-kun*, whereas in the scanlated version it is not explained,

but used nonetheless. The scanlation site offers a dictionary and explanation of terms for such matters that readers can resort to. It is clear in both the Turkish versions that they want the original culture to be retained.

In terms of Japanese names, the surname comes first and the name second. This has been retained in the scanlated versions, but the translated versions choose to invert the name to the Turkish standard of first name followed by last name.

In *Naruto* the examples for translation of names have been given in Table 1:

Table 1: Translation and scanlation of names

Translation	Scanlation
NARUTO UZUMAKİ	UZUMAKİ NARUTO
SASUKE ÜÇİHA	ÜÇİHA SASUKE
KAKAŞI HATAKE	HATAKE KAKAŞI

In terms of translating names the scanlated versions are opting for retaining the original cultural norms, whereas the translator opts for rare domestication in the naming culture throughout the series.

3.7 On translation strategies: Adding notes

One feature stands out as differing from other translated comics in Turkey in both the scanlated and the translated versions and that is the retention of Japanese words and the use of notes with asterisks to explain these. According to Rota (2008, 95) manga richly exploit Japanese culture and openly draw from folklore and traditions: for example manga often refer to classic demons and monsters, or legends and ninja and samurai are the lead characters. Thus, the uses of footnotes or end notes or glossary entries though embracing the foreignizing strategy, try to avoid disorienting the reader by providing cultural knowledge.

Table 2 containing examples from the translated and scanlated Turkish versions are as follows:

Table 2: Addition of notes

	Translated version	Scanlated version
p.12/7	HENGE NO HUTSU* *Değişme Tekniği	HENGE NO JUTSU* *Biçim Değiştirme Tekniği
Gloss	*Change Technique	*Form changing technique
P10/5	HOKAGE SAMA	HOKAGE SAMA* *Konohagakure'nin en güçlü ve yetkili ninjası
Gloss	No notes- Explanation about <i>-sama</i> given at the beginning of <i>tankoban</i>	*The highest and most powerful ninja in Konohagakure.

For example, there are a total of 5 notes in the first 10 pages of the scanlated version and 2 notes in the same pages of the translated version. It is clear in both cases

¹⁴ Turkish translated version: Masaşi Kişimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara Haksöyliylen and Mine Erkmen. Istanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.



that the scanlator and the translator chose to remain within the frame provided by the Japanese culture with no domestication, the scanlator willing to explain more about the culture, whereas the translator chose sometimes to leave out the explanation. This may be due to the fact that in most cases readers of manga generally started out with online scanlated versions, so the translator probably is addressing an audience whose majority already knows these terms. Another explanation may be that in most cases scanlators believe that notes in explanations of cultural features would make the text more familiar in the long run to the readers.

3.8 On translation strategies: Discourse for narrator

Just as important as the cultural features and formal features of the manga, is the language of the manga. For example, there are two distinct types of voices in the manga *Naruto*, the voice of the narrator and the voices of the characters. According to Taivalkoski (2013, p. 2) “voices represent identities and subject positions, they can be silenced manipulated or cherished” by translation.

In the Turkish versions of *Naruto*, the translator has used a different strategy when giving the narrator a voice in Turkish. An example for this can be given (in Table 3) in a comparison of the first page or the scanlated and translated versions:

Table 3: Narrators discourse

Scanlated version ¹⁵	Translated version ¹⁶
	

Unfortunately, an accurate back translation cannot be provided in English as the tense about to be referred to does not exist, thus an explanation may be given as follows: In the scanlated version the scanlator chose to use the simple past tense in Turkish, whereas in the translated version the translator chooses to use a tense in

Turkish referred to as the pluperfect tense which is used in storytelling and the recitation of legends, where the speaker is referring to a long long time ago, of which he personally has no recollection and the details have been told to him. This has added a sense of legendary and story like discourse to the translated version in Turkish. On the other hand the use of the past tense in the scanlated version draws the readers into the story as if it had just happened and he knew of it, it is first hand storytelling. Neither strategy detracts from the original, but adds a different flavour to the stories narrative voice.

3.9 On translation strategies: Discourse of the characters

Amador-Moreno (2011) cites some formal features that are associated with spoken discourse such as such as ejaculations and exclamations, tags, fillers, reformulations, false starts, stressing, hedging, backchanneling, forms of address, frequent use of deictic forms, lower lexical density, higher dependence on context, and strong interpersonal component. Many of these structures are present in the dialogues of the manga studied and have been retained as such by both the scanlator and the translator. In rendering speech as speech, in faithfulness to spoken discourse, in terms of structure there is no difference between the two versions.

On the other hand, in terms of the translation of dialogues there seems to be general tendencies in representing the spoken discourse of the various characters. Bandia (2011) defines orality as “the aesthetic representation of otherness, the assertion of marginalized identities” and Rosa (2015, p. 209) adapts this as literary representation of spoken discourse to show characters marginality by giving them a specific voice. In this vein, for example, there is a difference in terms of the use of shortened expressions and especially the use of slang. This is given in the Table 4.

Table 4: Use of slang

	Scanlated ¹⁷	Translated ¹⁸
P16/21	Şu velet, evet 'o velet' ve tek geçemeyen de o.	Bak o çocuğa, o çocuk sınavdan geçemeyen tek kişi
	That kid, he is a 'kid' and the only one who	Look at that child, he is the only person who was

¹⁵ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri. <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01>

¹⁶ Turkish translated version: Masaşi Kişimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara Haksöyliyen and Mine Erkmen. İstanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.

¹⁷ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri. <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01>

¹⁸ Turkish translated version: Masaşi Kişimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara Haksöyliyen and Mine Erkmen. İstanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.



	flunked the exam.	unable to pass the exam.
P27/32	Moronu iyi buldun	Onu nasıl buldun?
	So you found the moron.	How did you find him?

The use of 'velet' - kid and 'moron' - moron in the scanlated version is an example for the use of slang which is more abundant in this version when compared to the translated version. These are choices made by the translator and the scanlator; the reasons behind this may be, publishing house policy, the age of the scanlator and translator and their knowledge of the slang used by youth. That is not to say that the translator does not use slang, just that he tends to use it less frequently than in the scanlated version.

Furthermore, in the context of a multimodal text condensing the original may not mean that the translation is in any way less, as images can compensate for many translation strategies employed.

3.10 On translation strategies: The 'battling' vs. 'fighting' registers

One striking difference in terms of the two versions is the discourse used in referring to battle or fighting. The translators' choices underline the fact that he views the confrontations the ninjas have with monsters, each other etc. in the scope of fighting, whereas the scanlators consider this 'battle' and draw their lexical choices from military terminology. In the case of the scanlator this is a systematic choice followed diligently throughout the scanlated version, whereas the translator does use some military terminology and tends to go between the two discourses-fighting and battling. Table 5 presents instances of this:

Table 5: Use of registers

	Scanlated ¹⁹	Translated ²⁰
P21/26	Dördüncü gelene kadar mevzilerimizi korumalıyız.	Dördüncü gelene kadar onu oyala.
	We must retain our emplacement until the fourth arrives.	Keep it occupied until the fourth arrives
P21/26	Babam ve annem halen savaşıyor.	Annem ve babam hala dövüşüyor.
	My father and mother are still at battle.	My mother and father are still fighting

¹⁹ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri. <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01>

²⁰ Turkish translated version: Masaşi Kişimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara Haksöyliyen and Mine Erkmen. İstanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.

The use of 'emplacement' and 'at battle' in the scanlated versions versus the examples of the translated versions provide an understanding as to how the two versions view ninja battles or fights. The scanlator chooses to glorify the ninja as making war and battling, whereas the translator chooses to portray this as both fighting and battling.

3.11 On translation strategies: Native vs. non-native choices

As a final difference between the two versions, the translated version contains some, probably, what are very literal translations and non-native choices whereas the scanlated version, though retaining much more of the original on the lexical level, reads like a text full of native choices. Some examples are as given in Table 6:

Table 6: (Non) Native choices

	Scanlated ²¹	Translated ²²
P7/1 2	Neyse, ne	Evet, evet
	Whatever	Yes, yes
P17/ 22	İruki sensei disiplinli bir insan	İruki sensei'nin ciddi bir kişiliği var
	İruki sensei is discipline.	İruki sensei has a serious personalit.
P16/ 21	Şimdi erkek oldun işte!	Artık yetişkiniz biz!
	You are a man now.	We are adults now.

Of course, due to the fact that back translations cannot reflect the true nature of an utterance in terms of native choices very clearly, still the examples explain that even in English, though both versions are understood from the context of the story, referring to someone as 'having a serious personality' is not a natural choice when referring to harshness and the natural choice would be 'disciplined', or brushing off a comment with 'yes, yes' is understood from the stance of the character and the story line, but 'whatever' showing nonchalance is a more native choice.

This is not to say that in the translated version is full of non-native choices. The number of such choices when compared with the scanlated version, lead to the conclusion that the translator probably remained more faithful to the original in these cases, as faithfulness in translation tends to render this type of non-native stiltedness; whereas the scanlator, in the case of the speech of the characters, felt

²¹ Scanlated by: Çekirdek Çeviri. <http://www.turkcraft.com/Naruto/01>

²² Turkish translated version: Masaşi Kişimoto. 2015. *Naruto-Cilt 1*. Translated by: Tiafun Nitahara Haksöyliyen and Mine Erkmen. İstanbul: Gerekli Şeyler.

a need to allow the audience to form bonds through the more frequent use of native speech patterns. Again, the use of the different approaches may be due to several factors like talent, knowledge of target language discourses or even publishing house choices, or a wish to remain faithful versus a desire to internalize characters etc., both adding a different flavour to the text.

4. Conclusion

According to Valero Garcés (2000, p. 78) difficulties in comics translation arise from the type of comic, the language used, restricting elements and reproducing iconic language. In the comparison of the scanlated and translated versions of the Turkish translations of *Naruto* it is clear that the elements that have to be taken into consideration are even more numerous when it comes to manga.

In both cases studied, it is clear that manga is retained as something different from other comics translated in Turkey and its readers are receiving a product that has been foreignized in its transfer into Turkish. The idea seems to be that in translation of manga it is almost impossible to adapt or domesticate the text to the target culture without losing much of its essence and it cannot be disguised as something else. Thus, it must remain in the original to be appreciated.

In this vein, Jüngst (2008, p. 74) argues that manga production, translation is now quicker, easier and cheaper due to the fact that readers want more authenticity. He states that the manga has stepped over the cultural barrier, as manga readers now accept manga conventions as typical for a certain type of comic and not something imported from another culture.

As the study has outlined, it is important to study manga in translation studies for several reasons: primarily because of the unique features of manga; secondly because of the surge of manga in many languages and cultures; a third point of interest is the richness of techniques, employed by amateurs and professionals alike, to cope with the different elements and hurdles presented by the images, the text, the culture etc.; a fourth point is that this enlarges the scope of the decisions that have to be made in the process by the translator, as the translator is not only developing strategies for dealing with discourse, language and cultural features, but also has to make decisions concerning graphics, fonts, typography, use of pictures, audience expectations and reception of sense by different reader profiles; a fifth

point is that scanlation and comics translation, be it manga or another medium, should be integrated as at least elective courses for young translators since there is a market for this, and unless there is a corpus of multilingual comparative study this would not be possible; a sixth point is that scanlations of manga give rise to issues about the use of technology in translation and the use of this technology in the translation classroom and the possibilities of this practice.

In this sense, as was the effort behind the study, manga translations present translation studies with rich grounds of research into multimodal, multicultural dialogue and interaction. As Salor and Marasligil (2013, p. 9) state the potential for intercultural dialogue through comics has never been stronger than the present. Manga seem to be a medium through which this may be achieved across cultures.

Comparative studies in different languages and cultures would not only be a benefit for the comics' translators and scholars, but also the field of translation, as discussing the abundance of decisions and possibilities would enrich the discipline.

References

- Amador-Moreno, C., & McCafferty, K. (2011). Fictionalizing Orality: Introduction. *Sociolinguistic Studies*, 5 (1), 1–13.
- Anderson Terpstra, K. (2012). *Spreading the word: fan translations of manga in a global context*. Ph.D Doctor of Philosophy thesis. University of Iowa Research Online. <http://ir.uiowa.edu/etd/3423>.
- Armour, W. S & Iida S. (2016). Are Australian fans of anime and manga motivated to learn Japanese language? *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, Vol. 36, Iss. 1. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2014.922459>.
- Bandia, P. (2011). Orality and Translation. (Ed.) Y. Gambier & L. van Doorslaer. *Handbook of Translation Studies*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Berndt, J. (2001). The Relevance of 'Art' in Contemporary Japanese Manga Discourse. (Ed.) L. Monnet. *Critical Perspectives on Twentieth-Century Japanese Thought*, 349-375. Montreal: Montreal University Press.
- Berndt, J. (2004). The Time of Comics: Reading a Post/historical Art Form from the Perspective of Manga. *Aesthetics* (International Edition), 11, 13-19.
- Berndt, J. (2007). Traditions of Contemporary Manga: Relating Comics to Premodern Art. *SIGNS: Studies in Graphic Narratives*, (1), 33-47.



- Bonser, R. (2017). *Comics, Graphic Novels and Manga*. Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Brienza, C. (2009). Paratexts in Translation: reinterpreting manga for the United States. *The International Journal of the Book*, 6 (2), 13-20.
- Brienza, C. (2010). Producing comics culture: a sociological approach to the study of comics. *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*. Volume 1, Issue 2, 105-119.
- Bryce, M and David, J and Barber C. (2008). The Cultural Biographies and Social Lives of Manga: Lessons from Mangaverse. *SCAN Journal of Media Arts Culture*, 5 (2), 1-10.
- Bryce, M. et al. (2010). Manga and Anime: Fluidity and Hybridity in Global Imagery. *EJCS*. 29 Jan 2010, <http://www.japanesestudies.org.uk/articles/2010/Bryce.html>.
- Celotti, N. (2008). The Translator of Comics as a Semiotic Investigator. (Ed.) F. Zanettin. *Comics in Translation*. UK: St Jerome Publishing, 33-47.
- Couch, C. (2000). The Publication and Formats of Comics, Graphic Novels, and Tankobon. Image and Narrative. *Online Magazine of the Visual Narrative*, (1).
- Davis, N. (2016). *Manga and Anime go to Hollywood*. USA and UK: Bloomsbury Academic Press.
- de la Iglesia, M.. (2016). The Task of Manga Translation: Akira in the West. *The Comics Grid: Journal of Comics Scholarship*, 6(1), 1. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.16995/cg.59>.
- Eiji, O. (2017). An Industry Awaiting Reform: The Social Origins and Economics of Manga and Animation in Postwar Japan. *The Asia-Pacific Journal*. Japan Focus Volume 15, Issue 9, Number 1, Apr 27. <http://apjif.org/-Oguma-Eiji/5029/article.pdf>.
- Fabretti, M. (2016). The Use of Translation Notes in Manga Scanlation. *Transcultural*, vol. 8.2 (2016), 86-104. <http://ejournals.library.ualberta.ca/index.php/TC>.
- Freedman, A., & Slade, T. (Eds.), (2017). *Introducing Japanese popular culture*. Abingdon, UK: Routledge.
- Furuhata-Turner, H. (2013). Use of Comics Manga as a Learning tool to Teach Translation in Japanese. *The Journal of Language Teaching and Learning*, 2013-2, 72-83.
- Hahn Aquila, M.S. (2007). Fan Fiction Writers: New Narrative Themes or the Same Old Story? (Ed.) F. Lunning. *Mechademia*, Volume 2, 34-47. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Hall, E. (1977). *Beyond Culture*. New York: Doubleday.
- Hand, R. (2004). Dissecting the Gash: Sexual Horror in the 1980s and the Manga of Suehiro Maruo. *M/C Journal: A Journal of Media and Culture*, 7 (4).
- Huang, C-W. & Archer A. (2014). Fluidity of modes in the translation of manga: The case of Kishimoto's Naruto. *Visual Communication*. Vol 13, No 4, 471-486.
- Ito, K. (2002a). The Manga Culture in Japan. *Japan Studies Review*, 4 .
- Ito, K. (2002b). The World of Japanese Ladies comics: From Romantic Fantasy to Lustful Perversion. *Journal of Popular Culture*, 36 (1), 68-85.
- Ito, K. (2005). A History of Manga in the Context of Japanese Culture and Society. *The Journal of Popular Culture*, 38(3), 456-475.
- Jude, G. (2017). On Manga, Mimetics and the Feeling of (Reading a) Language: Toward a Situated Translational Practice. *Capacious Journal For Emerging Affect Inquiry*, Vol. 1, No. 1. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.22387/cap2016.3>.
- Jüngst, H. E. (2007). Manga in Germany- From Translation to Simulacrum. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*. Volume 14, Issue 4, 248-259.
- Jüngst, H. E. (2008). Translating Manga. (Ed.) F. Zanettin. *Comics in Translation*, 50-78. UK: St. Jerome Publications.
- Jüngst, H. E. (2010). Japanese Comics in Germany. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*. Volume 12, Issue 2, 83-105.
- Kaindl, K. (1999). Thump, Whizz, Boom: A Framework for the Study of Comics under Translation. *Target* 11:2, 263-288.
- Kaindl, K. (2004). Multimodality in the translation of humor in comics. (Ed.) E. Ventola. *Perspectives on Multimodality*, 173-192. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Krebs, S. (2006). On the Anticipation of Ethical Conflicts between Humans and Robots in Japanese Mangas. *International Review of Information Ethics*, 6.
- Levi, A. (2006). The Americanization of Anime and Manga: Negotiating Popular Culture. (Ed.) S.T Brown. *Cinema Anime: Critical Engagements with Japanese Animation*, 43-63. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- McLelland, Mark (Ed.). (2017). *The end of Cool Japan: Ethical, legal, and cultural challenges to Japanese popular culture*. Abingdon, UK: Routledge.
- MacWilliams, M. (2000). Japanese Comic Books and Religion: Osamu Tezuka's Story of the Buddha. (Ed.) T. Craig. *Japan Pop: Inside the World of*

- Japanese Pop Culture*, NY: M.E. Sharpe.
- MacWilliams, M. (2002). Revisioning Japanese Religiosity: Osamu Tezuka's *Hi no Tori* (The Phoenix). (Eds.) T. Craig & R. King. *Global Goes Local: Popular Culture in Asia*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press.
- Madeley, J. M. (2015). Transnational convergence culture: grassroots and corporate convergence in the conflict over amateur English translated manga. *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*. DOI: 10.1080/21504857.2015.1060617.
- Nakar, E. (2003). Nosing Around: Visual Representation of the Other in Japanese Society. *Anthropological Forum*, 13 (1).
- Natsume, F. (2006). Did New Treasure Island Revolutionise Framing in Manga? (Ed.) P. Brophy. *Osamu Tezuka: The Marvel of Manga*. Melbourne: National Gallery of Victoria.
- Ng, W. (2000). A comparative study of Japanese comics in Southwest Asia and East Asia. *International Journal of Comic Art*, 2 (1), 44-56.
- O'Hagan, M. (Ed). (2007). Manga, Anime and Video Games: Globalizing Japanese Cultural Productions. *Perspectives: Studies In Translatology*. Volume 14, Issue 4.
- Onoda, N. (2003). Tezuka Osamu and the Star System. *International Journal of Comic Art*, 5 (1).
- Otmazgin, N. & Suter, R. (Eds.). (2016). *Rewriting History in Manga: Stories for the Nation*. New York: Palgrave Mamillan.
- Pandey, R. (2000). The medieval in manga. *Postcolonial Studies: Culture, Politics, Economy*, 3 (1), 19-32.
- Pandey, R. (2001). The Pre in the Postmodern: The Horror Manga of Hino Hideshi. *Japanese Studies*, 21, 261-274.
- Pandey, R. (2008). Medieval Genealogies of Manga Horror." (Ed.) M. MacWilliams. *Japanese Visual Culture: Explorations in the World of Manga and Anime*. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe.
- Parlak, S. (2015). Türkiye'de Manga Yayıncılığı. <http://www.kitaphaber.com.tr/turkiyed-e-manga-yayinciligi-k1858.html>.
- Pilcher, T. & Brooks, B. (2005). *The Essential Guide to World Comics*. London: Collins and Brown.
- Phillipps, S. (2001). Images of Asia in Japanese Best-selling Manga. Paper presented at the *Second International Convention of Asia Scholars*, 2001, August 9-12, Freie Universitat, Berlin, Germany.
- Prough, J. (2010). Marketing Japan: Manga as Japan's New Ambassador. *ASIANetwork Exchange*, 17 (2), 54-68.
- Rommens, A. (2000). Manga storytelling/showing. *Image & Narrative: Online Magazine of the Visual Narrative* (1), 1.
- Rosa, A. A. (2015). Translating Orality, Recreating Otherness. *Translation Studies*, Volume 8, Issue 2, 209-225.
- Rota, V. (2008). Aspects of Adaptation. The Translatio of Comics Formats. (Ed.) F. Zanetti. *Comics in Translation*, 79-98. UK: St Jerome Publishing.
- Salor, E. & C. Marasligil. (2013). Translating Comics: It's not just in the bubble. *Norwich Papers*, Vol 21, University of East Anglia.
- Sell, C. (2011). Manga Translation and Interculture. *Mechedemia*, Vol 6, 93-108.
- Shamoon, D. (2003). Focalization and Narrative Voice in the Novels and Comics of Uchida Shungiku. *International Journal of Comic Art*, 5 (1).
- Taivalkoski-Shilov, K. (2013). Voices in the Field of Translation Studies. (Ed.) K. Taivalkoski-Shilov & M. Suchet. *Intertextual Voices in Translation*, 1-9. Quebec: Vita Traductiva.
- Tak-hung Chan, L. (2017). Imitation as translation: from Western theories of parody to Japanese postmodern pastiches. *Perspectives* Vol. 25, Iss. 2. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2016.1213305>.
- Toku, M. (2001). What is Manga?: The Influence of Pop-Culture in Adolescent Art. *Journal of Art Education*, 54 (2).
- Tsuji, N. (2001). Early Medieval Picture Scrolls as Ancestors of Anime and Manga. (Ed.) N. C. Rousmaniere. *Births and Rebirths in Japanese Art*. Leiden: Hotei Publishing.
- Valero Garcés, C. (2000). La traducion del comic: retos, estrategias y resultados. *TRANS*, No. 4, 75-88.
- Young, H.-T. (2008). *Problems of Translating Contemporary Japanese Comics into Chinese*. <http://hdl.handle.net/10722/51697>.
- Zanettin, F. (2008). Comics in Translation: An Overview. (Ed.) F. Zanetti. *Comics in Translation*, 1-32. UK: St Jerome Publishing.